



Uluslararası Sosyal Araştırmalar Dergisi

The Journal of International Social Research

Cilt: 6 Sayı: 25 Volume: 6 Issue: 25

-Prof. Dr. Hamza GÜNDOĞDU Armağanı-

www.sosyalarastirmalar.com Issn: 1307-9581

A COMPARATIVE STUDY ON THE QALANDAR DERVISHES IN SIYAH QALEM'S PAINTINGS WITH OTHER PAINTERS' PICTURES AND WRITTEN TEXTS

Tolga ERKAN*

Abstract

In different periods and geographies, the Qalandar dervishes were mentioned and depicted by several authors and artists such as Siyah Qalem. This article focuses on the figures attributed to the Qalandar dervishes in Siyah Qalem's paintings. Placing the Qalandar dervishes in Siyah Qalem paintings within the context of their appearances and features, this paper examines a diverse range of themes such as the Qalandars' origin, historical background, philosophy, cultural heritage, everyday life, immigrations, settlements, status and influences in the societies, clothes, accessories, music instruments and hierarchical structure in the order. To understand the Qalandar dervishes of Siyah Qalem, this paper compares resemblances and differences of the Qalandar figures in Siyah Qalem's paintings within respect to the written texts, poems and pictures of different authors, poets and painters about the Qalandariya order.

Keywords: Siyah Qalem, Qalandariya, Qalandar, Silk Road, Islamization of Turkic nomads.

1. Siyah Qalam

Many goods were traded as well as various migrations, cultures, religions, technologies, arts and philosophies traveled along the Silk Road. In the medieval ages, the paintings of Muhammad Siyah Qalem (Black Pen) present much valuable documentary information about various aspects of everyday life of nomads from various ethnic and religious origins along the Silk Road. (Steinhardt, 1987: 59, Çağman, 2005, pp. 148, 151) Siyah Qalem's art takes its sustenance from everyday life of the nomads' cultural world. Unfortunately, we do not see any specific descriptive background, which mentions any known region. It is therefore possible to characterize Siyah Qalem's art as the art of the Silk Road. (Işın, 2004: 11) However, the life of the painter is still unknown since it is not supported by any written text. Only his paintings prove that he lived. He knew features, beliefs and customs of the steppe people. The painter probably was a nomad. The inscriptions attributing the paintings to Siyah Qalem have prompted investigation into the artist's identity. The similar content pictures seem not to be the work of a single hand. (Steinhardt, 1987: 59; Çağman, 2005: 148) For instance, the Siyah Qalem paintings in Topkapi Palace and Freer Gallery were not produced by the same artist. Siyah Qalem was possibly a painting school in Transoxania or Khurasan in the fifteenth century. (İpşiroğlu, 1985, pp. 11, 12; Erol, 1986: 53; Steinhardt, 1987: 59, Çağman, 2005, pp. 148, 151) In other words, their place of origin has been set all over the Turkic speaking world. (Brend, 2004: 62)

* Dr., TOBB ETÜ, Söğütözü Cad. No: 43, Söğütözü, Ankara.

But the question is not limited only to the identity of the painter and the origin of pictures but how these paintings arrived to Istanbul. There are probably two ways how the paintings came to Istanbul. First, the paintings as spoils of the Battle of Chaldiran (ca. 1514) came to Istanbul with Yavuz Sultan Selim. (İpşiroğlu, 1985: 10) Second, the Sultan was welcomed by Bediü'z-Zaman Mirza with a group of Qalandar dervishes, when he entered Tabriz following his victory. Bediü'z-Zaman Mirza, who was one of Timur's grandchildren, belonged to the Qalandar order. Bediü'z-Zaman Mirza should have brought many pictures, albums and artists with him when he came to Istanbul. Yet the name of Muhammad Siyah Qalem was not among the artists. (Karamağaralı, 2004, pp. 30, 31) There is still no consensus even on the basic facts of Siyah Qalem-whether the signature is contemporary or a later attribution, for example, or whether it is of an individual or a workshop-or where, when and how Siyah Qalem School existed. (Steinhardt, 1987: 59; Karamağaralı, 2004: 13) Unfortunately, these images were not supported by any written text. Hence, their mentioned stories were not available until today. Perhaps these images may come from several different scrolls. Each scroll should tell a separate story. Due to pre-Islamic pagan myths features of the Siyah Qalems and difficulty to keep the pictures in its scroll forms. Nevertheless, for reason unknown to us, cut up by an official, whose identity is unknown, the scrolls are then cut into single pictures at some moment of blindness in the collective memory and arranged randomly in the pages of the albums 2152, 2153, 2154 and 2160 in the Treasury Library at Topkapi Palace Museum in Istanbul. Therefore, that unknown official created the Siyah Qalem query. Furthermore, there are non-Siyah Qalem pictures in the same albums. (İpşiroğlu, 1985, pp. 9, 10, 22; Işın, 2004: 9, Karamağaralı, 2004: 13)

Central Asia was a region where many different cultures existed in the Middle Ages. Western Central Asian culture had a unique character, converging Persian, Indian, Hellenistic and Chinese influences. The region where the nomad peoples wandered often passed through the rich nations which grew up along the Silk Road between China and Byzantium. The Turkic nomads not only accepted the customs of the settled communities to their own ways of life, but embraced many of their art forms. For instance, as far back in time the great artistic traditions of Hellenistic and Chinese forms and Buddhist humanism significantly influenced on the culture of steppe peoples. (İpşiroğlu, 1985: 28) This period in which the order and lodge art came into existence was the most suitable time for Siyah Qalem paintings due to the social conditions of western Central Asia. (Karamağaralı, 1969: 284)

The paintings attributed to the artist named Muhammad Siyah Qalem can be recognized as the most outstanding examples of all those in the *qalam-i siyāhī* style, to have survived from the Turkic world, originated from the Far East and Eastern Turkistan. However, the Siyah Qalem group stands apart from traditional examples of *qalam-i siyāhī* with their unusual themes and styles clearly have a different origin. (Çağman, 2005: 150) The Siyah Qalem paintings depict the lives and beliefs of Turkic nomadic communities on the steppe of western Central Asia who controlled the east-west trade route. Their common stylistic elements, color range, clothing, faces, ornamentation and other details of the figures give these pictures an affinity to be depicted during the reign of Timurid and Turkmen rulers. They don't resemble to the Tabriz painting style of Iran. On the other hand, the Siyah Qalems received strong influence from Chinese and Mongols. Under Mongol supremacy the Islamic world was influenced by the cultures of the Far East and Central Asia in which figurative painting enjoyed a privileged status. The Mongols brought scroll painting to the Near East. Therefore, the Siyah Qalems illustrate the influence of Silk Road and extension the possible transfer of symbols, iconography, meaning and artistic impact from China in the first half of the fifteenth century. They might also be interpreted as another reflection of the encounter via the Silk Road between the Far East, Central Asia and Iran under Timurid-Turkmen rule. (İpşiroğlu, 1985, pp. 11, 32; Erol, 1986, pp. 52, 53; Steinhardt, 1987, pp. 59, 66; Avcı, 2004: 17; Çağman, 2005: 156) The Siyah Qalem works might also be understood as studied interpretations, or reinterpretations, of Chinese painting in the course of which the figures and some other stylistic trademarks are transformed.

(Steinhardt, 1987: 66) However, we cannot come across high aesthetic value, unique drawing style, composition elements and layout of the Chinese paintings in the paintings of Siyah Qalem.

The Turkic nomads of Central Asia possessed a pictorial tradition relating to religious belief, and those pictures accompanying storytelling and the recital of religious texts by heart were part of a long-standing tradition since the sixth century. In Asian cultures dominated by Buddhism or Manichaeism, pictorial representation played a very important role in religious life. Hence storytelling of this kind became firmly established as a tradition in Central Asia before the coming of Islam. In the 15th century, towards the end of the Mongol period, Iran was caught up in a new wave of Islam. The pagan art of Siyah Qalem must at first have continued unaffected by this movement, but once the Islamic revival reached as far as Transoxiana local figural art movements vanished. The Siyah Qalems were produced apart from the context of book illustration and courtly patronage. The paintings were to illustrate recitations by storytellers who traveled from village to village giving their performances, perhaps sometimes in lodges of mystic heterodox Islam orders. (Ipşiroğlu, 1985: 10, 12, 29, 34; Ipşiroğlu, 2004: 43; Çağman, 2005, pp. 153, 155) The dance and music which were the principal elements of theatre played an important part in the lives of these nomad communities. (Ipşiroğlu, 1985: 29) Hence, the nomads should have been no strangers to scroll paintings so they could be easily carried during the migration. Unluckily, few scroll paintings have survived to the present day since they were made of fragile materials such as paper or silk.

1.2. Figures in Siyah Qalem

The main group of Muhammad Siyah Qalem paintings depicts the lives and beliefs of nomadic communities in Western Central Asia. (Çağman, 2005: 156) Also, the dervishes, Buddhists, shamans, Christian monks and demons feature in the Siyah Qalems. (Işın, 2004: 9) The figures have a round wrinkled face, eyes set wide apart, small flat nose, standing out chin, and wide mouth, between fleshy lips two rows of healthy teeth can be seen. (Ipşiroğlu, 1985: 10) Distortion is a significant characteristic feature in the paintings of Siyah Qalem. It was based on imaginative expression rather than observation. Some of his figures are not depicted from a specific angle according to the perspective rules. The distortion of figures seems his figures are in motion. This expressive visual feature presents emotions such as astonishment, fear, curiosity and joy. Siyah Qalem is very different from the traditional Islamic figurative art, where faces are inexpressive and figures are still. The paintings generally are not rich in color and number of figures. Red, blue and black are the main colors. Siyah Qalem doesn't paint surroundings of his figures. Marking the shadows and highlights on folds of their skirts and scarves remind of the pictorial traditions of Hellenistic art. Ipşiroğlu stated that the folds of clothes are reminiscent of the pictorial language use in fabric depicting in western Gothic art. Siyah Qalem painted the folds to indicate the mass of his figures. (1985, 36) We come across that painting style in the folds of fabrics in all Siyah Qalem paintings.

1.3. Qalandar Dervishes in the Paintings of Siyah Qalem

Modern ethnological research indicates that the nomadic communities of western Central Asia did not completely abandon the pre-Islamic pagan faiths and ceremonies of Shamanist times after their conversion to Islam. People look on dervishes as shamans of an earlier era, and believe that the dervish shaykhs have inherited the supernatural powers with which their ancestors invested the shamans. (Ipşiroğlu, 1985, pp. 21, 25, 26, 27) By several features, history and geography, the dervish figures of Siyah Qalem paintings have resemblance to Qalandar dervishes. Transoxiana was the home of many heterodox dervish orders such as the Qalandariya order. Islam education was in the hands of dervish orders which did not adapt easily to the Moslem seminary culture officially upheld by the state. These orders became power centers in the society and had a considerable influence over the masses. The dervish

lodges were usually located on the border of the steppe close to the nomad pastures. The intense spirituality, capability of doing miracles and supernatural powers attributed to the shaykhs. (Ipşiroğlu, 1985, pp. 12, 22, 25; Esin, 2004: 73; Roux, 2012: 190) His barefooted dervishes are all of the same order is evident from their simple costumes consisting of short skirt and long scarf or animal fur capes over their shoulders which they all wear, to which is sometimes added a felt hat. Some of dervishes also put on necklace, wristlet, anklet, pendant or earring.

Some of his paintings present different race of people. They should have been slaves, brought to Transoxiana. Some runaway slaves, who presumably took refuge in the lodges, were taken cover by dervish lodges in return for loyalty to the shaykhs. In the painting (Figure 1), an African is talking to a man with red hair and blue eyes. The red hair man may be either a racial figure or due to the use of henna. The seated figures with circular necklaces, bracelets, anklets and having rods in their hands also represent the features of Qalandar dervishes. (Karamağaralı, 1969: 283; Ipşiroğlu, 1985: 25, 38; Esin, 2004: 76) Both dervishes dressed in nothing but short skirts and long scarves draped over their shoulders. In addition the black man has an earring. Their clothes and accessories seemingly indicate that they belong to the Qalandariya order in this respect.



Fig. 1. Discussion, 25.6 x 17.7 cm, H. 2153: 128, in the Treasury Library at Topkapi Palace Museum, Istanbul, Ipşiroğlu, 1985.

The dervish figures with shaven heads, beardless faces, bodies naked to the waist, and wearing short skirts and sometimes animal skins over their shoulders, usually occur in groups of conversing figures. (Ipşiroğlu, 1985: 10; Çağman, 2005: 152, 153) In the painting titled "Wandering Dervishes" (Figure 2), two barefooted and shaven-headed dervishes with short skirts; one crouched on the ground, the other standing with a begging cup hanging from his wrist. Unluckily, their faces are partially damaged. However, their facial expressions and gestures probably indicate that they are talking about a subject. They have long-haired fur capes over their shoulders. These figures represent the Qalandar dervishes called *Abdalan-ı Rum* or *Divane* (ecstatic). According to the information of the sources, the Abdalan-ı Rum wore animal skins. (Karamağaralı, 1969: 282; Ipşiroğlu, 1985: 37, 38) In the painting of "Encounter" (Figure 3), two barefooted dervishes seemingly meet on the road. They dressed in animal fur capes and short skirts. They fashioned into waist-length cloaks, these still bear the head and claws and have been thrown over their shoulders. The leopard and tiger skins are depicted in their entire splendor. The dervish, who is depicted from the rear, shaved his hair. The other is depicted from the front, seemingly hidden his shaved head with the fur hat. (Ipşiroğlu, 1985: 37, 38) He presumably carries a bowl for begging or carrying food. The features of clothes of dervishes indicate that they belong to the Qalandariya order.



Fig. 2. Wandering Dervishes, 23.5 x 20.4 cm, H. 2153: 129b, in the Treasury Library at Topkapi Palace Museum, Istanbul, Ipşiroğlu, 1985.



Fig. 3. Encounter, 26.7 x 20 cm, H. 2153: 38b, in the Treasury Library at Topkapi Palace Museum, Istanbul, Ipşiroğlu, 1985.

The nomads did not entirely abandon the pre-Islamic pagan rituals of Shamanism such as music and dance after accepting Islam. During religious ceremonies of the Qalandars, music and dance also have an important place. In some of his paintings, music and dance themes are depicted. In the painting of “Musicians” (Figure 4), two barefooted dervishes sit facing one another, one playing a string instrument, the other dervish clapping his hands to participate the song. Siyah Qalem’s dervish figures are drawn in motion. Their open mouths and the taut lines of their faces indicate that they are singing. (Ipşiroğlu, 1985: 38) They dressed only short skirts and long scarves draped over their shoulders. Both shaved their heads and faces. The skirts and dresses fitting to the actions of the subject and were full of folds drawn with lines in shadows. (Karamağaralı, 1969: 283) In the painting of “Dancing Shamans” (Figure 5), two dark skinned dervishes are dancing with excitement. The revolving motion of dervishes is depicted by waving scarves. Siyah Qalem gives emotion to hands, feet and faces. The distortion of the limbs – one foot is shown from above, the other from below, and the elbow and wrist of one arm are twisted backwards – underscore the turning motion of the bodies. (Ipşiroğlu, 1985: 38) Hence, we can assume the dervishes in playing music and dance scenes belong to the Qalandar order in respect of their clothes, shaved heads and beards, playing a specific Turkish string instrument called *qopuz* and dancing men by facing each other and waving scarves.



Fig. 4. Musicians, part of Plate 30, 26 x 15.7 cm, H. 2153: 37b, in the Treasury Library at Topkapi Palace Museum, Istanbul, Ipşiroğlu, 1985.



Fig. 5. Dancing Shamans, 24.8 x 18.5 cm, H. 2153: 34b, in the Treasury Library at Topkapi Palace Museum, Istanbul. Ipşiroğlu, 1985.

2. Qalandar Dervishes

Heterodox orders of Islam, which is opposed to Sunni sect, is based on asceticism. In the eighth century, it existed in Baghdad and northeastern Iran. (Roux, 2006: 280) Mysticism of Islam divided into many branches. Their diversity is relevant to their origins in different dervish lodges. The Qalandariya mysticism is opposed to the center authority of Islam, material possession and rules of community. The Qalandar dervishes embraced this way of thinking and behavior in everyday life. The Qalandariya order firstly existed in Transoxiana and Khorasan. It is still unknown that who built the order. Shaykh al-Islam Khwaja Abdullah Ansari, famous Persian Sufi, who lived in Heart and then Khorasan, deceased in 1088. He mentioned Qalandariya order in his book titled, *Qalandar Namah*. (Gölpınarlı, 1991: 258, 259) Thus, we can reach earliest information about the Qalandariya, which order was a great heterodox Sufism movement from western Central Asia to Anatolia and the Balkans, not only in the eleventh century even in the subsequent centuries. The order reached a peak around the thirteenth century. The nativity of order starts with Qutb al-Din Haydar (d.c. 1200) and Jamāl ad-Din as-Sāwī (d.c. 1232/3) in Iran. They established specified the principles of Qalandariya order. Its principles and elements of the Qalandariya were also historically important in Samarkand. Generally, the Qalandariya order members were slaves, escaped prisoners, runaway princes, incompatible free-minded men opposed to their families, the Sharia law, moral rules of society and political thought of central authority. The principles of Qalandariya order were based on the Malāmatiyya movement at the beginning. The Malāmatiyya, which was one of the pioneer representatives of opposition wing in Islam with roots in northeastern Iran, contained early qualifications of the Unity of Existence (Wahdat al-Wujud) in the ninth century. Ebu Ahmed-i Abdal-i Chishti, who was one of the first Qalandars, was the member of the Malāmatiyya lodge in Herat. The Qalandars constituted their own principles of conformity by affecting similar

features such as wearing coarse garments such as animal fur capes and hats, carrying drum and shaving head completely. However, not all Qalandars shaved their heads completely, *chahār-zarb*, which is called four-shaves. (Figure 1, 2, 3, 6, 8, 9) It means the shaving of head-hair, eyebrows, moustache and beard. This shaving custom is against to the common Islamic tradition. The Qalandars marginalized themselves for reasons of spiritual commitment, convinced not seek human approval through conformity to official religious rules and social norms. The Qalandariya order was a source of inspiration for its subsequent orders, including the Abdāls, Jāmīs, Shams-i Tabrīzīs and Bektāshīs orders in Ottoman territories, the Jawālaqīyya and Haydariyya orders in Persian speaking lands, the Jalāliyya and Madāriyya orders in India, and the Naqshbandī order in Central Asia. For instance, the Bektāshiya was much influenced by Anatolian Qalandariya movement. Hājji Bektāsh Walī was a Qalandar dervish because of his relaxed approach to ritual obligations. During the Festivals of Sacrifice, he and the Qalandars went to the Shrine of Seyyid Battal Ghazi to participate in celebrations. (Ocak, 1999: x, 4-6, 13, 18, 171, 177, 197, 226; Türkiye Diyanet Vakfı, 2001: 253, 256; Renard, 2009: 51, 58, 150, 190; Ridgeon, 2010: 233, 239, 241, 254) Hājji Bektāsh Walī refused adopting the Sharia law, praying and joining the congregation of the mosque. (Ay, 2012: 17, 18) He also recommends drinking wine, dance and eating together with women. (Roux, 2012, 248) Haydariyya order found in Iran and spread to Anatolia and India, bearing noteworthy similarities to the Qalandariya. Like the Qalandars, they typically practiced celibacy, wore distinctive clothing and headgear, and sported prominent moustaches. They also wore iron rings on their various parts of bodies including genitals. (Renard, 2009: 104) According to Ahmad Eflāki, Jalāl ad-Dīn Muhammad Rūmī respected the Qalandars. Furthermore, many poems of Rūmī praised them. (Kayaoğlu, cilt 31: 150) Throughout the history of Islam, the Qalandariya order, which existed by voluntary philosophy of poverty in rural areas, often clashed with the central authority of Sunni Madrasah. For instance, the Qalandar shaykh Otman Baba, who disapproved the authority of Sunni, lived in northwest Anatolia and the Balkans. (Karamustafa, 2011: 61, 63, 118; Ay, 2012: 20) The non-Islamic features of the Qalandariya order have been associated with the ancient Inner Asia religions, the worship of heaven and earth, Manichaeism, Zoroastrianism, Christianity and Buddhism with its Indian connotations. In the work titled 'Menakīb-ı Jamāl ad-Dīn as-Sāwī' of the Hatīb-i Fārsī, the Qalandar dervishes clearly indicated their inspiration from Indian and Buddhist priests. (Kayaoğlu, cilt 31: 149; İpşiroğlu, 1985: 26; Ocak, 1999: 7-10, 13; Türkiye Diyanet Vakfı, 2001: 254; Esin, 2004: 73; Uğurlu, 2007: 5, 8) Jamāl ad-Dīn as-Sāwī spread the Qalandariya movement Middle East notably Egypt, India and Anatolia, in where members known in Turkish as torlaqs and once called abdāl. (Renard, 2009: 189, 190) According to his principles, the Qalandars prefer poverty in their life and life after death. This act depends on the philosophy of Prophet Muhammad. He also took up seriously the philosophy of dying before death and protected his purity as the prophet Joseph did. Jamāl ad-Dīn as-Sāwī shaved his head completely including eyebrows. (Kayaoğlu, cilt 31: 149; Cebecioğlu, cilt. 33: 168; Türkiye Diyanet Vakfı, 2001: 254; Karamustafa, 2011: 51, 52, 53, 56) The shaven scalp and face of some of Siyah Qalam's figures correspond to the purification rite of the Abdāl-Qalandar-Salmani. Even though, most of the Qalandars did *chahār-zarb*, all of them did not shave such as Sarı Saltık and Baba Baraq (Figure, 1, 2, 4). The Qalandar hid their shaven scalps, which they considered a solar crown, under a hat bearing the same radiating motif. Such high felt hats are repeatedly represented by Siyah Qalam (Figure 4). (Karamağaralı, 1969: 282; Esin, 2004: 76)

The ecstatic Qalandar mystics considered themselves above the Islam rules applicable to common mortals. For instance, the Qalandar shaykh Ebu Said-i Eb'l-Hayr, who lived in Nishapur, didn't follow the religious rules. The Qalandars often shown their common indifference such as being above moral rules of society, providing daily food by begging, carry a rod and begging bowl for food, not possessing anything and fortune telling in exchange for food. They were wandering in small groups under presence of preaching and propagating their faith. Their traveler characteristic represents no need to connect to one place in this temporary life (Figure 1, 4). They prefer to be single unless obtaining license to leave their order for

marrying. The Qalandars drink wine and smoke/eat opium to raise their spirits to a sort of distracted mirth and account very holy and divine in imitation of their first founders of the order in all ages and geographies. (Rycaut, 1686: 265-267; Gölpınarlı, 1963: 214; Kayaoğlu, cilt 31: 149, 150; Cebecioğlu, cilt. 33: 168; Ocak, 1999: 7-10, 21, 171, 172, 197; Türkiye Diyanet Vakfı, 2001: 256; Esin, 2004: 75; Leaman, 2004: 63; Renard, 2009: 83; Ridgeon, 2010: 241; Karamustafa, 2011: 11, 13, 16, 28, 29; 83)

The Qalandar dervishes are committed to music, and see music and dance as significant ways of coming close to God, to recalling him back into our lives. When in ecstasy, the Qalandars danced to the sound of diverse instruments: drums, horns, stringed instruments and bells with the percussion of two chips. They equally played the qobuz, the stringed instrument accompanying the recitation of Turkish epics. Haydar Tilbe, an ecstatic Qalandar poet dervish, describes the state of rapture in which the Qalandar started to dance: "Arise! This the hour of the Turk's manifestation on earth... Sing the Turkish song to the mode of the qobuz". Such scenes appear in Siyah Qalem's work, together with the symbol of the cup, in dances with handkerchiefs. The Qalandar Shaykh Baba Baraq was dancing like a bear and singing like a monkey, when his follower dervishes played their musical instruments. The sounds of his shouts, bells, cymbals and metal rings on him horrified his audiences, while the Qalandar Shaykh Baba Baraq was dancing. His dance and its tripartite rhythm are evoked in his ode. (Ocak, 1999: 172; Esin, 2004: 75, 76; Leaman, 2004: 77; Karamustafa, 2011: 11) According to the descriptions in the texts, the music and dance rituals of Qalandar dervishes highly fit the dervish figures in the paintings of Siyah Qalem (Figure 5, 6).

The garments of Inner Asian dervishes might have been connected with the divergent customs of northern and southern zones. Turkish hats were worn by the Abdal, the Yasavi the northern Qalandars and the shamans. Their two piece costume consisting of short skirt and scarf or fur cap over their shoulders. Some dervishes wear wrist or ankle bracelets, pendants or earrings. These appearances are clearly seen in the paintings of Siyah Qalem (Figure 1-6). A more southern group of dervishes, the Shamsi-Qalandar dervishes were almost nude. According to chronicles, the Qalandars had originally been naked. (Cebecioğlu, cilt. 33: 169; İpşiroğlu, 1985: 26; Esin, 2004: 77, 80) For instance, the Qalandar sheiks such as Cemâleddin Sâvî, Kutbeddîn Haydar and Otman Baba wore no clothes and also denied charity during their life. The nakedness of Qalandars is related to the prophet Adam. The Qalandar shaykh Baba Tahir-i Uryan Hemedani walk around semi naked. In 1055, the founder of Great Seljuq Empire, Tughril Beg, visited take advice from the Qalandar shaykh about fair treatment among people. (Ocak, 1999: 19) The dervishes, who stay away from sexuality by cold showers and piercing genitals with rings, dedicate themselves to the sexual sinless of the prophet Joseph. For instance, Kutbeddîn Haydar, who lived in Khorasan, put iron rings on his neck, wrist, ankle and genital. However, we do not come across any Qalandar figures with piercings on genitals in the paintings of Siyah Qalem. According to 'Menâkib-i of Cemâleddin Sâvî' and 'Velâyetnâme of Baba Baraq', the dervishes repeat the Takbîr instead of praying and fasting. Additionally, the Qalandars do not pilgrimage to Mecca and relieve because of not possessing any money and goods. (Karamustafa, 2011: 24-28, 57, 60) Different Qalandar manifestations existed. For instance, Baba Tâhir-i Uryân, bin Fâhru'd-Dîn-i Irakî and Şems-i Tebrîzî embraced refined and aesthetic philosophy of the Qalandariya order. However, the Qalandarism features very rude and strange in the shaykh Otman Baba. Thus, the Qalandar dervishes began to catch up by interpreting poverty and reckless life in the understanding of Islam mysticism. (Ocak, 1999: 3-5, 7-10, 11, 13, 17, 23)

From the eleventh century onwards, the dervishes played an important role of the Islamization of Anatolia. The Turkmen nomads divided into small groups and settled in Anatolia by the leadership of sheiks and dervishes of heterodox orders such as the Qalandariya. These dervishes and sheiks also settled in secluded empty villages to build new settlements for coming immigrants. In the thirteenth century, the great Turkic nomads escaping from the Mongols and took refuge in Anatolia. Additionally, the Mongol invasion caused a great impact

on political, social, religious and economic changes in Anatolia. Thus, the Turkmen people gathered around the shaykhs and dervishes in search of Islam, salvation, settlement and security. Many Qalandars dervishes traveled from village to village and town to town to spread their own beliefs and ideas. The similarities are their status and responsibilities of figures in social and political life as well as their music instruments, clothes and accessories. During this, the most turbulent time in Anatolia, heterodox orders gained power. Therefore, shamanism beliefs and customs had continued under the cover of Islam among the esoteric orders of Anatolia. (Hacıgökmen: 186; Arnold, 1956: 130; Karamağaralı, 1969: 277, 284; Kayaoğlu, cilt 31: 147, 155; Cebecioğlu, cilt. 33: 160; İpşiroğlu, 1985: 9; Doğru, 1992: 27; Tezcan, 1993: 2; Avcı, 2004: 17, 18; Aykut, 2004: 21; Kökel, 2006: 141; Roux, 2012: 240, 248; Ay, 2012: 2)

3. Qalandar Dervishes through the eyes of Other Painters

In the following centuries, the Qalandariya order continued their distinct identities in Anatolia and the Balkans. The Ottoman land was very suitable for the existence of Qalandar dervishes. In 1404, the Spanish traveler, Ruy Gonzales de Clavijo mentioned almost nude Qalandar dervishes, who shaved hair, beard and moustache in Delibaba village in Erzurum in eastern Anatolia. They were wandering by playing the tambourines and chanting. (Clavijo, 1928: 139, 140; Karamustafa, 2011: 12) In the sixteenth century, the increasing power of the Sunni Madrasa, the strong pressure of Sharia law, the state, public and family pressure reawakened ascetic, individualism and anarchist tendencies in the Ottoman land. Hence, young men from all classes of society as well as intellectuals from rich families tended to the Qalandar order. The Qalandar dervishes followed the doctrines of first Qalandar shayks such as Jamāl ad-Dīn as-Sāwī and Otman Baba. The dervishes adopted poverty, self-extinction and wisdom. They also made extreme interpretations about these notions. (Karamustafa, 2011: 109-113)

The Qalandars continued their same characteristics such as philosophy, believes, customs and influences in different societies as before, although their clothes and accessories slightly differentiated in order to different region and time. A wandering Qalandar dervish features in a painting in the Treasury Library at Topkapı Palace Museum by unknown artist. (Figure 6) This Qalandar figure matches to the dervishes in the paintings of Siyah Qalem, except some diversity. For instance, he probably says prayers of Quran from a booklet in his hand. The Qalandar hangs a horn, probably a bag for opium and other unidentified objects to his waist. Additionally, his circular burn marks made of hot iron bar are seen clearly on his entire body. These different appearances are not depicted in the Qalandar paintings of Siyah Qalem.



Fig. 6. Unkown artist. A Qalandar dervish in the sixteenth century, Topkapı Palace Museum Library, Album No: H 2146. Ocak, 1999. fig. 3.

In the sixteenth century, European travelers mentioned the Qalandar dervishes in their books. The Italian traveler, Teodoro Spandugino mentioned of the Qalandars as Torlacchi (Torlaq) in his documentary work between 1510 and 1519. They wore short skirts, unlined felt

cloaks or animal fur capes over their shoulders. These appearances of Qalandars are also seen in the paintings of Siyah Qalem. According to Spandugino, the Qalandar dervishes, who were begging, were riding donkey in day and were having depraved perverse intercourse with their donkey in night. Additionally, another Italian traveler, Giovanni Antonio Menavino mentioned the Qalandars as Torlacchi, who were begging for their daily food necessities. Menavino's description of the Qalandars truly supports the writings of Spandugino. For instance, the Qalandars have indecorous sexual acts. They also try fraudulent tricks to collect charity especially from women. (Karamustafa, 2011: 81, 82) Furthermore, the French traveler Nicolas de Nicolay stated the similar characteristics of the Qalandars as the descriptions of Spandugino and Menavino. In the book of Nicolas de Nicolay, a Qalandar dervish doing palmistry to a woman in exchange of food is depicted in a picture. (Figure 7) In the picture, he wears only a high felt hat and two animal furs one on his shoulder and the other around his body. The European travelers mentioned the clothes of Torlacchis as Qalandars, fit closely to the Qalandar figures in the paintings signed by Siyah Qalem. On the other hand, their shameful customs are not seen in the paintings of Siyah Qalem. According to the Ottoman poem Vahidi, the qalandars are carrying bowl and rods. They are nude except their short skirts and gowns. They are playing tambourines, small twin drums, bells, and horns and praying the Takbir, while they are traveling in shoes. (Figure 8) They eat opium, go bare foot, and shave scalp and face. (Köprülü, 1989: 374-375; Gölpınarlı, 1991: 258; Karamustafa, 2011: 81, 82, 87) Vahidi's definitions about appearances of the Qalandars match to the dervishes of Siyah Qalem.



Fig. 7. Nicolas de Nicolay, Torlaqui a Religious Turk (a Qalandar dervish) 26.7 x 16.8 cm. "L'histoire de la décadence de l'empire grec et établissement de celui des Turcs." Karamustafa, 2011, figure 1.



Fig. 8. Unknown western painter. A group of traveling Qalandar dervishes in the sixteenth century. XVI yüzyılda İstanbul: Kent-Saray-Günlük Yaşam, İstanbul, 1993, Akbank Yayını. Ocak, 1999, fig. 21.

In the seventeenth century, Sir Paul Rycaut, English Consul of Izmir, mentioned the Qalandar dervishes in his book. According to his book, they interpret Islam by a different way of libertinism, anomaly and looseness in their speech and manner, which they are not ashamed of. They are lazy and avoid working themselves. The Qalandars travel upon charity one place to another by propagating their order and customs (Figure 9). They also associate some kind of legerdemain to amuse the minds of people. For instance, a Qalandar dervish strikes a great weight stone to his bare chest. Another dervish holds red hot iron bar in his mouth. Some dervishes apply themselves to sorceries and conjurations by help of familiar spirits. For instance, the dervishes do fortune telling especially to women. They attach to celibacy. (Figure 10) They addict themselves to drink wine and eat opium to raise their spirits to imitated divine of the first founders of order. Hence, their habits of drinking wine and eating opium are lawful and allowable in the Qalandariya order. (Rycaut, 1687: 67-69, 71) In respect of their two pieces costumes and habits of not working, traveling and being unmarried, the features of Qalandar dervishes mentioned by Rycaut highly resemble to the dervishes in Siyah Qalems. Furthermore, in the paintings of western painters, the Qalandar dervishes are seen through western drawing style such as *mise en scène* and perfectly modeled, realistically proportioned and arranged figures on behalf of their iconography. Another example of the Qalandar dervishes, this miniature features two mendicants or demonic personages (Figure 11). European influence is strong both in colors and the draping of the costumes. (Binney, 1973: 98) Their shaved scalps, ornaments, short skirts and traveler traits are in accordance with the Qalandars in the paintings of Siyah Qalem. Just the opposite, these figures wear long sleeve clothes, shoes and many accessories on their waist. These features are not seen in the paintings of Siyah Qalem. The reasons for this, these two Qalandar dervishes probably were depicted at high altitude, during the winter time.



Fig. 9. A Qalandar dervish in seventeenth century, Paul Rycaut, *The Present State of the Ottoman Empire*, London 1668. Ocak, 1999.



Fig. 10. A Qalandar dervish in seventeenth century, Paul Rycaut, *The Present State of the Ottoman Empire*, Paris 1670. Ocak, 1999.



Fig. 11. Two torlaqs (wild youths) or shamans walking in a mountainous landscape. Early or mid-eighteenth century. Mounted on an album leaf. 22.54 x 13.34 cm. A panel of Persian calligraphy by Muhammed Amin. Binney, *Turkish Miniature Paintings & Manuscripts*, fig. 36, 1973.

Conclusion

In the paintings of Siyah Qalem, the features of Qalandar dervishes highly resemble to the Qalandar figures in the pictures of other artists and the written texts of authors in respect of appearances, cloths and accessories. Unluckily, we can only presume what the Qalandar dervishes do in the Siyah Qalem paintings because of not being supported by any text. There are some dissimilarity in respect of appearances of the Qalandar dervishes between Qalandar figures of Siyah Qalem and other artists' dervishes, which depend on several factors. Siyah Qalem paintings, which represent the nomads' pictorial language of the Silk Road with the influences of Chinese and Hellenistic pictorial traditions, are produced in the scrolls outside the context of book illustration and apart from courtly patronage in Transoxiana in the fifteenth century. However, European artists only painted the Qalandars in respect of documentary understanding of the book illustration. Siyah Qalem probably lived so close to the Qalandars, therefore he depicted them in their everyday activities and special rituals such as playing music and dancing. We do not come across Qalandars in those scenes in the pictures of other painters except traveling in small groups, posing alone and fortune telling. Although, the Qalandar figures of other painters are depicted with different accessories such as horns, bags, shoes and piercings, we do not see any of them in Siyah Qalem paintings. Additionally, we do not see any

Siyah Qalem's paintings related to the scenes of drinking wine, eating opium, being totally naked and committing shameful sexual acts, even though these features are clearly mentioned in the written texts of authors. Either Siyah Qalem did not paint the Qalandars in such scenes or the official of Topkapi Palace censored such paintings of Qalandars by not placing in the albums. These differences of Qalandar figures can be associated in the production of pictures in different time, pictorial language, intention, viewpoint and origin of the painters. Except these dissimilarities, the dervish figures of Siyah Qalem highly resemble to the Qalandars in the pictures of other artists and the written texts of authors.

REFERENCES

- Aşkar, Mustafa. Bir Türk Tarikatı Olarak Halvetiyye'nin Tarihi Gelişimi ve Halvetiye Silsilesinin Tahlili, Ankara Üniversitesi İlahiyat Fakültesi Dergisi, Cilt 39, pp. 535-563.
- Avcı, Aytaç. (2004) Siyah Kalem Minyatürlerinde Giysi ve Eşya, Sanat Dünyamız, Sayı 93, pp. 16-19.
- Ay, Resul. (2012) Sufi Shaykhs and Society in Thirteenth and Fifteenth Century Anatolia: Spiritual Influence And Rivalry, Journal of Islamic Studies, doi:10.1093/jis/ets067, pp. 1-24.
- Aykut, Sait. (2004) Siyah Kalem'in Cinlerini Dönemin En Yaygın Cin Bilim Kitaplarında Aramak, Sanat Dünyamız, Sayı 93, pp. 21-33.
- Brend, Barbara. (2004) Siyah Qalam: A Problematic Term, ed. Ekrem Işın, I, Mehmed Siyah Kalem Master of Humans and Demons, Istanbul: Yapı Kredi Yayınları.
- Binney, Edwin. (1973) Turkish Miniature Paintings & Manuscripts, Metropolitan Museum of Art & Los Angeles County Museum of Art.
- Cebecioglu, E. Güney Asya'da İslamın Yayılması, Ankara Üniversitesi İlahiyat Fakültesi Dergisi, Cilt: 33, 157-178.
- Cebecioglu, E. Hoca Ahmed Yesevi, Ankara Üniversitesi İlahiyat Fakültesi Dergisi, Cilt: 34, 87-132.
- Çağman, Filiz. (2005) Glimpses into the Fourteenth-Century Turkic World of Central Asia: The Paintings of Muhammad Siyah Qalam, ed. David J. Roxburgh, London: Royal Academy of Arts. pp. 147-188.
- Clavijo, Ruy Gonzales de. (1928) Embassy to Tamerlane 1403-1406, Translator: Guy le Starng, New York: Harper and Brothers.
- Doğru, Halime. (1992). XVI. Yüzyılda Eskişehir ve Sultanönü Sancağı, İstanbul.
- Erol, Turan. (1986) Fatih Albümü ve Mehmet Siyah Kalem Sorunu, Sanat Yazıları, Sayı 1, pp. 51-56.
- Esin, Emel. (2004) Muhammad Siyah Qalam and the Inner Asian Turkish Tradition, ed. Ekrem Işın, I, Mehmed Siyah Kalem Master of Humans and Demons, Istanbul: Yapı Kredi Yayınları.
- Esin, Emel. (2004) Muhammad Siyah Qalam and the Inner Asian Turkish Tradition, ed. Mine Haydaroglu, I, Mehmed Siyah Kalem Master of Humans and Demons, Istanbul: Yapı Kredi Kültür Sanat Yayıncılık.
- Hacıgökmen, Mehmet Ali. Commercial Activities of the Ahi Groups in Ankara and Baciyan-i Rum, OTAM-Ankara Üniversitesi Osmanlı Tarihi Araştırma ve Uygulama Merkezi Dergisi, Vol. 18, pp. 185-211.
- Hasan, Nadir. (2012) Yassawi Studies in West, Türk Kültürü ve Hacı Bektaş Veli Araştırma Dergisi, 61, pp. 151-168.
- Işın, Ekrem. (2004) Feast and Magic / The Mysterious World of Mehmed Siyah Kalem, ed. Ekrem Işın, I, Mehmed Siyah Kalem Master of Humans and Demons, İstanbul: Yapı Kredi Yayınları.
- İpşiroğlu, Mazhar Ş. (1985) Bozkır Rüzgarı, İstanbul: Ada Yayınları.
- İpşiroğlu, Mazhar Ş. (2004) Tarihsel Bağlantıları İçinde Siyah Kalem, Artsit, Sayı 23/9, pp. 40-45.
- Jahn, Karl. Tebriz Doğu ile Batı arasında bir Ortaçağ Kültür Merkezi. Translation: Ismail Aka, Ankara Üniversitesi Dil ve Tarih-Coğrafya Fakültesi Tarih Bölümü Tarih Araştırmaları Dergisi, Cilt 13, Vol. 24, pp. 59-77.
- Gölpınarlı, Abdülbaki. (1963) Alevi-Bektaşî Nefesleri, İstanbul:
- Gömeç, Saadettin. (2003) Eski Türk İnancı Üzerine bir Özet, Ankara Üniversitesi Dil ve Tarih-Coğrafya fakültesi Tarih Bölümü Araştırmaları Dergisi, Cilt 21, Sayı 33, pp. 79-104.
- Karamağaralı, Beyhan. (1969) The Order and Convent Art from XIIIth to XVIth centuries in Anatolia, Ankara Üniversitesi İlahiyat Fakültesi Dergisi, Cilt: 21, 277-284.
- Karamustafa, Ahmet, T. (2011) God's Unruly Friends - Dervish Graps in the Islamic Later Middle Period 120-1550, Tanrının Kuraltanırmaz Kulları - İslam Dünyasında Derviş Toplulukları 1200-1550, Translator: Ruşen Sezer, İstanbul: Yapı Kredi Yayınları.
- Kayaoglu, Ismet. Mevlana'nın Çağdaş Derviş Tarikatları, Babalar, Kalenderiler ve Diğerleri, Ankara Üniversitesi İlahiyat Fakültesi Dergisi, Cilt: 31, 147-155.
- Kökel, Coşkun. (2006) Eskişehir Yöresi Alevi-Bektaşî Kültürünün Temel Dinamikleri, Türk Kültürü ve Hacı Bektaş Veli, 37, pp. 135-172.
- Köprülü, M. Fuad. (1989) Edebiyat Araştırmaları 2, İstanbul: Ötüken Neşriyat.
- Leaman, Oliver. (2004) Islamic Aesthetics, Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press.
- Karamağaralı, Beyhan. (2004) Miniatures Attributed to Muhammed Siyah Kalem, ed. Ekrem Işın, I, Mehmed Siyah Kalem Master of Humans and Demons, İstanbul: Yapı Kredi Yayınları.
- Ocak, Ahmet Yaşar. (1999) Kalenderiler, Ankara: Türkiye Mühendisler Birliği.
- Renard, John. (2009) The A to Z of Sufizm, Lanham: The Scarecrow Press.
- Ridgeon, Lloyd. (2010) Shaggy or Shaved? The Symbolism of Hair among Persian Qalandar Sufis, Iran & The Caucasus, Vol. 14 Issue 2, pp. 233-263.

- Roux, Jean-Paul. (2006) Orta Asya – Tarih ve Uygarlık (L'Asie Centrale – Histoire et Civilisations), the 2nd edition, Translator: Lale Arslan, Istanbul: Kabalci Yayınevi.
- Roux, Jean-Paul. (2012) Türklerin Tarihi (Histoire Des Turcs), the 8th edition, Translators: Aykut Kazancıgil & Lale Arslan Özcan, Istanbul: Kabalci Yayınevi.
- Rycaut, Paul. (1686) The History of the Present State of the Ottoman Empire. The 6th edition, printed for Charles Brome, London: the West-End of St. Paul's Church-Yard.
- Steinhardt, Nancy Shatzman. (1987) Siyah Qalem and Gong Kai: An Istanbul Album Painter and a Chinese Painter of the Mongolian Period, Muqarnas, Vol. 4, (1987), pp. 59-71,
- Tezcan, Mahmut. (1993) Ahmed Yesevinin Türk Din Antropolojisindeki Yeri, Ankara Üniversitesi Eğitim Bilimleri Fakültesi Dergisi, Cilt 26, Sayı 1, pp. 1-7.
- Türkiye Diyanet Vakfı. (2001) Türkiye Diyanet Vakfı İslam Ansiklopedis, Vol. 24, Istanbul: Türkiye Diyanet Vakfı İslam Araştırmaları Merkezi.
- Uğurlu, Kamil. (2007) Türkistan Tasvirleri, Ankara: Türk Dünyası.